ASIA 338: Bioethics and Indian Traditions
Spring 2018
T/Th 10:50-12:05

Professor: Brianne Donaldson; www.briannedonaldson.com
Office: Chao Center for Asian Studies, Mech Lab 206
E-mail: brianne.donaldson@rice.edu
Office Hours: Tuesday 12:15-3:15; Will add online hours in February as research begins; other times by appointment

खामेमि सव्वजीवे, सव्वे जीवा खमंतु मे ।
मित्ती मे सव्व भुएसु, वेरम् मज्झं न केणइ ॥

Khāmemi savva-jīve, savve jive khamantu me/
metti me savva-bhūesu, veraṃ majjha na keṇavi//[1]

I ask pardon of all creatures, may all creatures pardon me.
May I have friendship with all beings and enmity with none.
—*Pratikramaṇa-sūtra*, 49

DESCRIPTION
The last fifty years of scientific knowledge and technological developments have led to numerous ethical dilemmas surrounding the manipulation of bodies, and the definition of what constitutes life itself. Given this rise in knowledge, the field of ethics—already multiple in its applications—strains to answer crucial new questions.

This course will examine normative ethical theories in the west alongside key features of ancient Indian religious-philosophical traditions (primarily Hinduism, Buddhism, and Jainism) regarding definitions of life, death, and consciousness, how to define value in life, the role of autonomy and consent, understandings of disability, the role of pain and pleasure, and how these concepts might apply to clinical issues of animal research, abortion, disorders of consciousness, assisted suicide, organ donation, reproductive technologies, cloning and gene therapy, end of life decisions, and health care access, with a special emphasis on what *ahiṃsā*, or non-harm, might mean in these scenarios.

STUDENT LEARNING OUTCOMES (SLO)
1. Articulate 3-4 normative ethical theories in the west.
2. Explain key concepts in bioethics
3. Describe key features of Hindu, Buddhist, and Jain ontology and ethics (what is real, and how we act).
4. Identity key tensions within contemporary bioethical issues
5. Analyze at least one contemporary bioethical issue in depth utilizing #1-4 above.
6. Gain tangible research and citation skills

[1] R. Williams, *Jaina Yoga: A Survey of the Mediaeval Śrāvakācāras* (Delhi: Motilal Banarsidass, [1963] 1991), 207.

ASSESSMENT OPPORTUNITIES

1. Comprehension Worksheets (assesses SLOs #1, 2, 3)
2. Worksheet Quizzes (assesses SLOs #1, 2, 3)
3. Bioethical Research Project, Part 1, 2, and 3 (assesses SLOs #1-6)
4. Attendance and Participation (assesses SLOs #1, 2, 3, 4, 6)

REQUIRED TEXTS – *You must have a copy of these three texts in class; hard copy is seriously encouraged. You must show me a digital copy.*

- Thomas Mappes and David DeGrazia, Eds. *Biomedical Ethics, 7th Edition* (McGraw-Hill, 2000). *be sure to get correct edition; Amazon Used price $26.00
- Christopher Key Chapple, *Nonviolence to Animals, Earth, and Self in Asian Traditions* (Albany: SUNY Press, 1993). Amazon Used price: $3.50
- Swati Bhattacharyya, *Magical Progeny, Modern Technology: A Hindu Bioethics of Assisted Reproductive Technology* (Albany: SUNY Press, 2006). Amazon Used price $22.00
- *Bedford Handbook* for research citations (required segment is in Google Docs)
- Miscellaneous Readings (Google Docs); *I strongly recommend printing these articles out and annotating on them or having written notes or research charts in class with questions and key points to accompany your digital copy*

RECOMMENDED READING

- S. Cromwell Crawford, *Hindu Bioethics for the Twenty-first Century* (New York: SUNY, 2003)
- Damien Keown, *Buddhism and Bioethics* (Palgrave Macmillan, 2001)
- Lucy Bregman, *Religion, Death, and Dying (3 Volume Set)* (Praeger, 2009
- Mary Pat Fisher, *Living Religions, 5th-8th* edition (Prentice Hall)
- Albert R. Jonsen, Mark Siegler, William Winslade, *Clinical Ethics: A Practical Approach to Ethical Decisions In Clinical Medicine, 8th Edition* (McGraw Hill, 2015)
- David E. Guinn, *Handbook of Bioethics and Religion* (Oxford University Press, 2006)
- David Chidester, *Patterns of Transcendence: Religion, Death, and Dying, 2nd Edition* (Wadsworth Cengage Learning, 2002)
- Ronald Munson, *Intervention and Reflection: Basic Issues in Bioethics, Concise Edition* (Wadsworth Cengage Learning, 2014)
- Stephen Holland, Ed. *Arguing About Bioethics* (Routledge 2012)
- Peter A. Singer, Ed*., The Cambridge Textbook of Bioethics* (University of Toronto)
- Padmanabh S. Jaini, *The Jaina Path of Purification* (Motilal Banarsidass, 2001)
- Padmanabh S. Jaini, *Collected Papers on Jaina Studies* (Motilal Banarsidass, 2010)
- Hermann Georg Jacobi, *Jaina Sutras: Part I and II* (Forgotten Books, 2008)
- Umāsvāti, *The Tattvārtha Sūtra (That Which Is): A Classic Jain Manual for Understanding the True Nature of Reality*, trans. Nathmal Tatia (Yale University Press, 2011)
- Nancy S. Jecker, Albert R. Jonsen, Robert A. Pearlman, Eds. *Bioethics: Introduction to History, Methods, and Practice, 2nd Edition* (Jones & Bartlett Publishers, 2007)
- Peter Harvey, *An Introduction to Buddhist Ethics* (Cambridge Univ Press, 2000)

GOOGLE DOCS AND LATE WORK

All written assignments will be turned in through Google Docs (except quizzes, worksheets, and

question sets; see below), using my Rice email: brianne.donaldson@rice.edu. You have a one-hour grace period. Beyond that, work will be accepted, but marked down 1pt for assignments of 0-20 pts; marked down 3pts for assignments of 40pts; marked down 4pts for assignments over 40pts.

LAPTOP POLICY

I recommend students prepare notes for every class so key ideas and questions are written out, which will minimize your need to sift through digital docs. Phones and laptops can be helpful to look up certain passages or concepts during class discussion—and to take notes—but they can also tempt you toward email and cat memes; know yourself well enough to make the choice.

DIVERSE ABILITY SUPPORT SERVICES

If you have a documented disability that may affect academic performance, you should: 1) make sure this documentation is on file with Disability Support Services (Allen Center, Room 111 / adarice@rice.edu / x5841) to determine the accommodations you need; and 2) meet with me to discuss your accommodation needs.

ASSESSMENTS *(*can be adjusted by instructor during the semester)

Attendance Mandatory; see description below	
Basic Knowledge (approx. 40% of grade)	
Worksheets (8 at 10-20pts each)	140
Quizzes (2 at 10pts; 3 at 20pts each; lowest tossed)	60
Participation (approx. 12% of grade)	
Neighborly Reading Summaries (12 x 5pts)	60
Bioethical Research Project (approx. 32% of grade)	
Part 1 (submitting 2-3 topics for research project)	
Part 2	40
Part 3	40
Part 4	40
Part 5 (Presentation)	40
Final Exam (approx. 20% of grade)	80
TOTAL	**500**

A	93-100%	465-500
A-	90-93%	450-464
B+	87-90%	435-449
B	84-87%	420-434
B-	80-84%	400-419
C+	77-80	385-399
C	74-77%	370-384
C-	70-74%	350-369
D+	67-70%	335-349
D	64-67%	320-334
D-	60-64%	300-319

ASSESSEMENT DESCRIPTIONS

1. Attendance

The aim in this class is to *practice* ethical thinking. To that end, I keep an attendance record. At the *third* unexcused absence, you will receive a half-step reduction in the total class grade (B+ to B), and a half step for every absence after that. Doing the math, if a student misses 10 classes, they will fail the class, even if all work is at a high level. Excused absences include a campus-related absence that I am notified about *before* the event by another professor, an extended documented medical event, or family death (with relevant notification provided to me). If you arrive in class after 11:30, that is considered an absence.

2. Basic Knowledge

A. Worksheets (8 at 10-20pts each; total 140pts)

Throughout the semester (and especially the first month), there will be worksheets that accompany the readings to ensure that certain key concepts are mastered. Our collective conversations will be much more productive if every student is fluent in these terms. Worksheets provide foundational material for quizzes, and the final exam. Each worksheet is worth 10-20 points.

B. Quizzes (2 at 10pts each; 3 at 20pts each)

In order to ensure reading comprehension of key concepts established throughout the first month of class, there will be five quizzes as noted in the syllabus. These will be given in hard copy form at the start of class and cannot be made up beyond that day. When grading, I will combine Quiz 1 and 2 into one 20pt quiz and I will throw out the lowest scoring quiz of the four 20pt totals.

3. Participation (12 of 15 possible at 5pts each=60pts)

Beginning on week 5, students will create Neighborly Reading Summaries for <u>every</u> reading we do. This means that for each reading you will type or hand write (don't forget your name) the following 4 items:

1. Title and Author
2. Identify the primary argument or aim of this reading.
3. Describe the deep motivating concern of the author; put another way, why do you think the author feels compelled to invest their time making this particular argument?
4. Choose <u>one</u> of the following to answer: (a) What question or insight emerges for you in one or more of these readings? (b) Connect this reading to other readings we've completed, OR (c) How does this reading differ from other approaches to the topic?

<u>Grading:</u> These will be due in <u>hard copy at the start of each class</u>, either typed or hand-written (legibly). We will use the notes in class, so if you feel that printing will be an issue, hand-write. Of the 15 possible sessions, students will be graded for 12 of these, receiving 5 points for each so long as each of that day's readings are represented with the 4 above items. You get three days when you can "Pass." When you choose to pass, please turn in a handwritten page with your name that reads "Pass 1," "Pass 2," or "Pass 3." If you are absent, you can turn in the Summary at the start of <u>next</u> class period without penalty.

4. Bioethics Research Project (5 Parts: 0, 40, 40, 40, and 40 points respectively)

This project offers students a chance to carefully consider a chosen bioethical issue in multiple stages:

- Part 1: Select a Topic
- Part 2: Research Chart on sources related to the topic
- Part 3: Examine the tensions in Part 2 through Western normative ethical theories
- Part 4: Examine the tensions in Part 2 through one Indian tradition
- Part 5: Present your research to the class

The benefit of a progressive project is that you have 4 stages to deeply explore a project. The drawback is that, since the 4 parts are connected, you must complete each stage thoughtfully to move on the next.

Part 1: Submit 3 Options for Research Project (0pts)

Due Thursday 1/23 by class time

Submit list of 3 possible bioethical topics, *in order of your desire*, to Brianne by class time through brianne.donaldson@rice.edu; this is also a time to ask any questions you might have. The purpose of this is to prevent duplication of projects; duplicate requests will be privileged based on submission time. I will respond through email by Saturday to confirm your selection and/or with questions.

Part 2: Defining my Bioethical Issue and its Ethical Tensions Research Chart (40pts)

Due Tuesday 2/13 by class time

Students should choose a minimum of 1 encyclopedic reference source, and 2 substantial peer-reviewed research sources (books, chapters, or journal articles) on the specific topic you have selected. Popular sources, medical website sources, videos, or case studies can be used in addition to these three if you choose. You will then complete the following:

1. You will create a research chart for each of these sources (see Appendix A on syllabus).
2. You will create a Works Cited (WC) entry for each of the sources you choose, using the Bedford Handbook in Docs.
3. Drawing upon your research chart you will write 1 paragraph that succinctly defines your issue from multiple sources. You should demonstrate your ability to use signal phrases, quotes, and paraphrases using appropriate in-text citations.
4. You will name 3 *detailed* tensions that make your issue ethically problematic, offering a short 2-3-sentence description with any relevant citations under each tension. *Tip for brainstorming this portion: Your research sources should highlight various ethical tensions, which you will have to identify or interpret in order to create this list. Another way to think about tensions is: (a) Imagine that you were going to host a debate on your issue. What positions might be represented and what are the points of disagreement? (b) Are there pro-, anti-, or "in between" positions? (c) Are there religious/legal/medical disputes? (d) If your family or friend group was arguing over this at the holiday table, what might be at stake? These are just a few ways to consider these tensions. I recommend everyone to come in to see me for in-person or virtual office hours.

Grading: Each of the above 4 items is worth 10 points, for a total of 40. The above items will all

be necessary for Part 3, 4, and 5 of the research project.

Part 3: Examining the Ethical Tensions from Westerner normative theories (40pts)
Due Thursday 3/8 by class time
Thesis-based essay; description to come
1200-1500 words, excluding WC
WC required
See rubric for grading (Appendix B)
Double Spaced, 12-pt Times font

Part 4: An Analysis of Your Issue and its Tensions from an Indian Tradition (40pts)
Due Thursday 4/19
Thesis-based essay; description to come
2000-2300 words, excluding WC
WC required
See rubric for grading (Appendix B)
Double Spaced, 12-pt Times font

Part 5: In-Class Presentation (40pts)
Presentations 4/17, 4/19, and final exam day
A traditional or creative presentation (such as spoken word, photo essay, dramatic reading, song, artistic piece) to convey the evolution in understanding you have made on this topic; description to come

5. Final Exam (80pts)
Due Wednesday 5/2 at midnight
The final exam will be a take home exam featuring matching from quizzes, short answer, and essay questions. I will email it to you on Thursday 4/19.

SCHEDULE

Reading Key:

- BE: *Biomedical Ethics*, 7th Ed.
- Docs: *On Google Docs*

Session	Read	Due
WEEK 1 Tues 1/9	• *Magical Progeny*, Ch 1 (I'll distribute in class)	
— WESTERN NORMATIVE ETHICAL THEORIES —		
Thurs 1/11	Utilitarianism/Consequentialism • BE: Recently Dominant Ethical Theories, 4-7 • BE: Act-Utilitarianism, 7-13 • Docs: Bentham, Principles of Morals and Legislation	• Worksheet 1 Due (10pts)
WEEK 2 Tues 1/16	Deontology • BE: Kantian Deontology, 17-23 • Docs: Kant, Fundamental Principles, 188-224	• Worksheet 2 Due (10pts) • Quiz 1
Thurs 1/18	Alternative Theories • BE: Prima Facie Duties 23-26 • BE: Alt. Directions and Methods, 27-36 • Docs: Gilligan (Feminist Ethics of Care) Intro and Ch 2 • Docs: Rawls, Theory of Justice, 378-84 only	• Worksheet 3 Due (20pts)
WEEK 3 Tues 1/23	Key Concepts • BE: 40-70	• Worksheet 4 Due (10pts) • Quiz 2 • RESEARCH PART 1 TOPICS DUE BY CLASS TIME (email)
— FOUNDATIONS FOR INDIAN THOUGHT —		
Thurs 1/25	• Docs: Long, Introduction, *Historical Dictionary of Hinduism*, 1-21 • *Ṛg Veda* (1500-1200 BCE) Creation Hymn, The Golden Embryo, Puruṣa-Sūkta, 23-32 • *Chāndogya Upaniṣad* (500-700 BCE), 6th Chapter, 1st-13th khaṇḍa, 240-248	• Hinduism Worksheet 5 Due (20pts) • Quiz 3/Hinduism
WEEK 4 Tues 1/30	Buddhism • Docs: Harvey, *An Introduction to Buddhist Ethics*, 8-21; 31-43 • *Lotus-sūtra* (200-300 CE), 43-48	• Buddhism Worksheet 6 Due (20pts) • Quiz 4/Buddhism

Thurs 2/1	Jainism • Wiley, Introduction, *The A to Z of Jainism*, 1-20 • *Ācāraṅga-sūtra* (3rd–1st century BCE), 32-38 • *Tattvārtha-sūtra* (2nd-5th-cent. CE), Chapter 2, p. 29-63 (read the bolded verses written by Umāsvāti; you can read any of the commentary or translator's notes that you like but it is not required)	• Jainism Worksheet 7 Due • Quiz 5/Jainism

— BIOETHICAL ISSUES IN COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE —

WEEK 5 Tues 2/6	Defining Death • BE: Death and Decisions 316-321 • Docs: Chidester, Asian Transcendence (Hindu/Vedic and Buddhist), 75-98	NEIGHBORLY READING SUMMARIES BEGIN (12 out of next 15 sessions due hard copy start of class period; see instructions at start of syllabus)
Thurs 2/8	NO CLASS: SPRING RECESS	
WEEK 6 Tues 2/13	Defining Death • BE: Bernat, 322-332 • BE: McMahan, 333-340 • Docs: Stuart, Mendicants and Medicine: Āyurveda in Jain Monastic Texts (63-72)	RESEARCH PART 2 DUE BY CLASS TIME (email)
Thurs 2/15	NO CLASS: BD GONE	
WEEK 7 Tues 2/20	Defining Death • Docs: Stuart, Mendicants and Medicine: Āyurveda in Jain Monastic Texts (72-97) • Docs: Keown, Buddhism and Bioethics (40-56; up to section on Reproduction)	
Thursday 2/22	Genetic/Reproductive Engineering • BE: 523-32 • *Magical Progeny*, Ch 2 (29-48) • Docs: Keown, Buddhism and Bioethics (56-60; up to section on Death/dying)	
WEEK 8 Tues 2/27	Genetic/Reproductive Engineering - IVF • BE: Singer, 544-48 • BE: Sherwin, 548-52 • *Magical Progeny*, Ch 3-4 (49-75)	
Thurs 3/1	Genetic/Reproductive Engineering	

	• Magical Progeny, Ch 5 and Conclusion (76-108)	
WEEK 9 Tues 3/6	Human/Animal Research • BE: 243-259 • BE: Glantz, et al. 278-83 • BE: Fair Benefits, 288-92 • Chapple, *Nonviolence to Animals, Earth, and Self in Asian Traditions* (NAES), Ch 1 (1-20)	
Thurs 3/8	Animal Research • BE: Cohen, 292-98 • BE: DeGrazia, 305-13 • Docs: Singer, Practical Ethics	RESEARCH PART 3 DUE BY CLASS TIME (email)
WEEK 10 Tues 3/13	NO CLASS: SPRING BREAK	
Thurs 3/15	NO CLASS: SPRING BREAK	
WEEK 11 Tues 3/20	• Watch "Maximum Tolerated Dose" (video in Docs) • Chapple *NSAE*, Ch 2 (21-48)	• Complete Film Worksheet 8 (20pts) • NO NEIGHBORLY READING SUMMARIES TODAY
Thurs 3/22	Abortion • BE: 456-465 • Roe vs. Wade, BE: 492-496 • Chapple *NSAE*, Ch 5, 85-98	
WEEK 12 Tues 3/27	• BE: Pope John Paul II, 466-468 • BE: Warren, 468-474 • BE: Marquis, 475-479	
Thurs 3/29	• BE: Little, 487-492 • Docs: Jaini, Karma and the Problem of Rebirth in Jainism (121-143)	
WEEK 13 Tues 4/3	Physician Aid-in-Dying • BE: Suicide, Phys-Assist Suicide . . . 376-84 • BE: Rachels, Active and Passive Euthanasia, 395-399 • BE, Callahan, Killing and Allowing to Die, 399-402 • BE, Brock, Voluntary Active Euth, 402-404 • Keown, Buddhism and Bioethics (60-68)	
Thurs 4/5	Physician Aid-in-Dying	

	• BE: Orentilicher, The Supreme Court..., 414-418 • Chapple *NSAE*, Ch 6 (99-110)	
WEEK 14 Tues 4/10	Physician Aid-in Dying • BE: Oregon Death with Dignity Act, *Biomed Ethics*, 421-426 • BE: Bernat, Gert, Mogielnicki, Patient Refusal of Hydration and Nutrition, 438-444 • Docs: Wujastyk, Medicine and Dharma (831-842)	
Thurs 4/12	Cloning • BE: Kass, Cloning of Human Beings, 577-80 • BE: Wachbroit, Genetic Encores, 583-88 • BE: Murray, Even if it Worked . . . , 580-83	In class: *This American Life* segment on cloning?
WEEK 15 Tues 4/17	**Final Presentations**	
Thurs 4/19	**Final Presentations**	• RESEARCH PART 4 DUE AT CLASS TIME (email) • FINAL EXAM EMAILED TO YOU
Tues 4/24	NO CLASS: STUDY DAYS	
Weds 4/25-Weds 5/2 FINAL EXAMS	**Final Presentations**	
		FINAL EXAM DUE BY EMAIL WEDS. 5/2 BY MIDNIGHT

POSSIBLE TOPICS FOR RESEARCH PROJECT

- Abortion*
- Alternative Medicine
- Animal rights
- Animal experimentation*
- Animals and the military
- Animal cloning
- Animals for food
- Artificial insemination*
- Assisted suicide*
- Biological patent/Biopiracy
- Biocentric/Biotic ethics
- Biodiversity loss
- Blood transfusion
- Body modification
- Brain-computer interface
- Chimeras (animals modified for human organ use)
- Chemical/biological warfare
- Circumcision (Male)
- Clinical trials of medical interventions
- Cloning*
- Contraception (birth control)*
- Cryonics
- Disability
- Disorders of Consciousness
- Eugenics
- Euthanasia (human)*
- Euthanasia (non-human)*

- Faith Healing
- Farming (Industrial)
- Farming (Small-scale)
- Feeding tube
- Female Genital Mutilation
- Gene therapy
- Genetically modified food
- Genetically modified organisms
- Genomics
- Great Ape Project
- Human cloning
- Human enhancement
- Human experimentation in the United States
- Human genetic engineering
- Iatrogenesis (physician-induced condition)
- Infertility treatments
- Life extension
- Life support
- Meat eating
- Meat, Plant-based or Cell Cultured
- Nanomedicine
- Nazi human experimentation data
- Organ donation
- Organ transplant
- Organ trade (black market)
- Pain management
- Parthenogenesis
- Pharmacogenetics
- Plant ethics
- Population control
- Recreational drug use
- Reproductive rights*
- Sex reassignment therapy/surgery
- Sperm and egg donation
- Spiritual drug use
- Stem cell research*
- Suicide*
- Surrogacy
- Three-parent babies
- Vaccination controversy
- Voluntary Death (*Sallekhanā* in the Jain Tradition, or other examples)
- Xenotransplantation (cross-species transplant or transfusion

APPENDIX A: SAMPLE RESEARCH CHART

Padmanabh S. Jaini, "Ahiṃsā and 'Just War' in Jainism" in *Ahiṃsā, Anekānta and Jainism*, ed. Tara Sethia

48	The orientation of the Jaina discussion on ahimsa, thus, proceeds from the perspective of one's own soul and no so much from that standpoint of the protection of other beings or the welfare of humanity as a whole. First Knowledge (of self) then compassion – Daśavaikālika-sūtra iv paḍhamaṃ nāṇaṃ tao dayāevaṃ ciṭṭhai savvasaṃjae	Notes
50	awareness of ahimsa is a constant concern for the individual, involving total mindfulness in mental, oral, and physical activities. Ahimsa is a creed in its own right; identified with its own spiritual impulses and informing all of one's activities . . . a way of personal discipline	ahimsa as personal discipline mendicant/lay divide; 2 kinds of vows (bioethics)
51	lay people must refrain from saḳalpaja hiṃsā – intentionally planned violence or injury, uphold vegetarianism, and adopt a proper means of livelihood (ārambhaja-hiṃsā- injury done while in occupational violence) forbidden animal husbandry, trade in alcohol, animal byproducts, accepted: commerce/business, arts and crafts, clerical and admin occupations	

52	military svc, not generally expected of Jaina laymen so they could follow their relig law; Jaina laymen were yet given accommodation to certain types of violence associated with their legit occupations. But a grey area of 'just war' remained, or violence in defense of one's property, honor, family, community of nation: Here duties to self and society mattered. QUOTE: "The duty of a Jaina mendicant in this case was quite clear: he must not retaliate in any way and must be willing to sacrifice his own life in order to keep his vow of total nonviolence." For a Jaina lay person, however, appropriate conduct is not so clear cut. There were always situation in which violence would be a last resort in guiding the interests of himself and his community. The Jaina lawgivers of medieval times accorded with customary Hindu law in these matters. Somadeva (c 10th ce, stipulated that 'a king should strike down only those enemeies of his kingdom who appear on the battlefielf bearing arems, but never those people who are downtrodden, weak, or who are friends' (Yaśastilaka-campū, ii, 97)	mendicant/lay duties different regarding self-defense
55	Morals of Bahūbali story: 1 valor preferalble to cowardice 2 reduce necessary vio to minimus 3 vio ultimately settles nothing and often leads to more vio over possessions, etc 4 true nonvio cannot be practiced by a society or person who craves possessions	

APPENDIX B: ESSAY RUBRIC

Topic Thesis (20%)

Addressed assigned topic, effective intro, present arguable thesis

Analysis and Content (50%)

Used specific evidence (quotes) from text to support thesis
Effective reasoning/assumption to support thesis/explain position
Identifies, summarizes the problem, question, issue
Identifies/considers the influence of context and assumptions
Develops, presents, and communicated own perspective, hypothesis or position

Organization (20%)

Organization flows from thesis
Smooth transition between paragraphs/ideas/main points
Logical sequence

Mechanics (10%)

Used variety of effective, grammatically correct sentences
Used correct documentation and integrates quotes effectively
Used correct grammar, spelling, word choice
Adhered to formatting guideline